

while the violence was unfolding. The truth revealed by the CVR, thus, allowed for the remaking of the political community, reintegrating these neglected victims into society, while also restoring their dignity.

The varied contexts and experiences surrounding exhumation processes across the globe as highlighted in the cases studies tackled in this volume underscore the heterogeneity of existing practices and the different ways in which societies have dealt with difficult pasts. Nonetheless, despite the existence of diverse practices, exhumations contribute to broader and widely shared objectives of justice, truth and reparation, in providing evidence for judicial proceedings, returning the remains of loved ones to family members, and disseminating knowledge of past atrocities to society. The chapters importantly show how, despite the various ways in which exhumations have unfolded across cases, there are numerous common experiences and shared problems faced by relatives, survivors and forensic experts, as well as shared goals and objectives that underpin the opening of mass graves. Exhumations are profoundly linked to local realities that are deeply tied to political, social and cultural contexts, while simultaneously they also constitute global mechanisms that sustain broader truth, justice and reparations goals in societies struggling to come to terms with difficult pasts across the world. Due to the interdisciplinary nature of exhumations – including as it does forensic medicine, anthropology, history, law and psychology – this volume reminds us of the importance of comparative and multidisciplinary research that brings together the personal with the public, the local with the transnational, as well as the tensions that exist among these realms. The book will be of especial interest to advanced graduate students as well as to scholars and practitioners.

Latin American Centre, University of Oxford

FRANCESCA LESSA

J. Lat. Amer. Stud. 49 (2017). doi:10.1017/S0022216X17000281

Sarah Zukerman Daly, *Organized Violence after Civil War: The Geography of Recruitment in Latin America* (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 344, £64.99, hb.

The recent rejection of the peace process between the Colombian government and the country's largest insurgent organisation, the Fuerzas Armadas Revolucionarias de Colombia (Revolutionary Armed Forces of Colombia, FARC), by a slim majority in a public referendum defied the forecasts of both domestic and foreign experts, as well as various preliminary polls conducted in the build-up to the plebiscite. However, this outcome becomes less of a surprise when one contemplates the past 30 years of this protracted civil war. Previous failed peace attempts between the FARC and the Colombian government in both the mid-1980s and early 2000s generated widespread public discontent with formal negotiations, while the controversial demobilisation of the paramilitary umbrella group, Autodefensas Unidas de Colombia (United Self-Defence Forces of Colombia, AUC), in 2005 was quickly followed by a swift nationwide remilitarisation of various factions who reneged on their commitments to disarming. In *Organized Violence after Civil War: The Geography of Recruitment in Latin America*, Sarah Zukerman Daly investigates this phenomenon at length and examines why paramilitaries demobilised permanently, temporarily, or not at all, and what this ultimately means in the context of establishing a durable peace.

The product of over ten years of extensive fieldwork in various far-flung corners of Colombia, Zukerman Daly offers a fresh contribution to the quickly expanding pantheon of micro-level literature on civil wars by examining a crucial yet hitherto unexplored avenue of study: the remilitarisation of violent armed non-state actors following the permanent cessation of hostilities. As the examples of El Salvador, South Africa and Guatemala have shown, the implementation of such peace accords does not necessarily guarantee a long-term reduction in violence, and with the recent proliferation of such armed groups in North Africa, the Middle East and South Asia, this book sheds light on a topic of critical importance: the post-war trajectories of armed groups.

As the Colombian case demonstrates, the prospect of remilitarisation poses very serious short- and long-term threats to a lasting peace in any context. Zukerman Daly documents this fact in impressive detail; according to official statistics, some 37 different paramilitary groups comprising 35,310 fighters agreed to the same terms with the Colombian government between 2003 and 2006, with 17 of these groups remilitarising in short order. This not only calls into question the effectiveness of these particular negotiations, but also begs a far more troubling question as to 'why peace consolidates in some contexts while violence recurs in others' (p. 3). For the author, this puzzle can be explained by both the geography of recruitment and the local configuration of armed actors at the moment of demobilisation and beyond.

Using a mixed-methods approach combining the results of 11 surveys with organisational and municipal level datasets (some constructed by Zukerman Daly herself) and extensive in-depth interviews with a wide array of ex-combatants, government officials and other assorted experts on the topic, this book examines demobilisation and remilitarisation in three detailed case studies in different regions of Colombia. The author finds that group cohesion and collective action capacity after war is the best indicator of whether a particular actor will lay down its arms for good, or only temporarily. This capacity for collective action, Zukerman Daly argues, is dependent on the geography of recruitment, as fighters and leaders of paramilitary groups who were recruited locally possess far denser ties to local communities which 'help resolve the collective action and principal agent problems that arise when the necessity of waging war and the overt coercion of the military chain of command has been removed' (p. 21). Local fighters and commanders were also far more likely to remain in their communities post-demobilisation and hence, 'their wartime endowments remained intact', whereas non-locals 'by contrast, tended to lose these assets' (p. 89).

Whereas locally recruited groups are 'better able to translate their war power to peacetime power' than non-locally recruited groups and hence better disciplined to adhere to the terms of a demobilisation – or to reject them outright – another key factor for Zukerman Daly is the local configuration of armed actors at this critical juncture (p. 23). Quite simply, 'the strategic set of belligerent groups – whether they are local, non-local, or mixed – determines whether the power balance endures or shifts in the aftermath of the negotiated accords' (p. 24). Local groups – or those which surpass a 30 per cent threshold of locally recruited fighters – who strategically interact with other local paramilitary groups and the state, will most likely demobilise permanently. However, those local groups which are in contact with non-local groups are most likely to remilitarise, as non-local groups should remilitarise in almost all cases, albeit in a weaker fashion than local groups. The reason for this is that 'power shifts and information problems should be associated with remilitarization, whereas sustained power balances should be associated with demilitarization' (p. 98).

In other words, when groups have reliable local intelligence and have credible commitments that they can disarm without being the victim of violent reprisals from other violent non-state actors or the state, they most probably will. This is substantially more likely in a dynamic where these groups are composed of local recruits.

With this absorbing text, Sarah Zukerman Daly has made a compelling contribution to the existing canon on micro-level studies of violence and civil war. Along with other scholars such as Paul Staniland, she has highlighted the importance of social networks in the propagation of peace or the continuation of conflict in contested environments, and in the process validated the merits of an explanatory framework which simultaneously challenges and complements those based on rationalist models and political economy. And although this book might have benefitted from a more detailed examination of the historical composition of what the author refers to as ‘social architecture’, or the local hierarchies on which these very social networks have evolved, Sarah Zukerman Daly has broken fresh ground in a field of study where the necessities of research can be extreme and original data hard to come by.

University of Toronto

CHARLES LARRATT-SMITH

J. Lat. Amer. Stud. 49 (2017). doi:10.1017/S0022216X17000293

Rebecca Weitz-Shapiro, *Curbing Clientelism in Argentina: Politics, Poverty, and Social Policy* (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2014), pp. xi + 195, \$90.00; £55.00, hb.

Curbing Clientelism in Argentina seeks to answer an important question: why do some politicians engage in clientelism while others opt out or develop different political practices to build support? In answering this question, Rebecca Weitz-Shapiro’s book contributes to two distinct research programmes: first, to a long-standing discussion about what clientelism is and how it is practised; second, to a much newer debate on subnational variations in democracy and governance, because Weitz-Shapiro’s book focuses on variations in the use of clientelism across local (municipal) governments in Argentina. As scholars of subnational democracy have shown, the quality of democracy varies within countries that are nationally democratic because political structures and practices vary across subnational units. Weitz-Shapiro focuses on one political practice – clientelism – and offers an explanation for its subnational variation by testing a novel hypothesis: that there are ‘audience costs’ associated to the practice of clientelism. That is, clientelism is viewed negatively by non-poor voters and therefore mayors in districts with a large middle class can lose votes if they engage in clientelistic practices. However, the book argues, mayors will only take this view into account if they face high levels of political competition (i.e., when non-poor voters have a clear political alternative). Thus, the existence of a large middle class alone is a necessary but insufficient condition for a mayor to abandon clientelistic practices.

Weitz-Shapiro tests her claim through surveys that show voters’ attitudes toward the distribution of goods by political parties. The surveys’ results are what one would expect: non-poor voters who have no need for such distribution view it negatively, while poor voters who do need it view it more favourably. She also conducts an experiment that uncovers that non-poor voters are likely to withdraw support for mayors who engage in clientelistic practices. The evidence presented in the study therefore shows that municipal districts that are either poor and less competitive, or have a large middle class, but are less competitive, will tend to be more clientelistic. In turn,